## **Discussion Meet Judges Sheet**

| Room Name:Round #  |              | for addition<br>contestant.<br>Columns to<br>first and las | nal detail. The tot<br>You are not divident<br>the right each re<br>t name of each c<br>right starting wit | al point value for<br>ling the total point<br>epresent a differe<br>ompetitor accord | ues and description is avail to the second reach row is avail onte among contestent contestant. Pleading to their seat in the larger space | able for each stants. <b>No ties.</b> ease fill in the location, |
|--|--------------|--|--|--|--|--|
|  | Comp A Name: | Comp B Name:   | Comp C Name:   | Comp D Name:   | Comp E Name:   | Comp F Name:   |
| (1) OPENING STATEMENT:  Defines problem; conveys importance and relevance; sets the stage for an interesting discussion; clear point of view; uses time wisely   |              |  |  |  |  |  |
| (2) ANALYSIS OF TOPIC OR PROBLEM: 20 pts.  Has thoroughly researched topic; builds on the ideas of others to help achieve coherent analysis; asks relevant questions; helps ensure thorough analysis before problem solving; aware of relevant FB policy |              |  |  |  |  |  |
| (3) PROBLEM SOLVING AND IMPLEMENTATION: 25 pts.  Leader in guiding the conversation to specific and relevant solutions; has achievable and specific plan of action; clearly defines how FB is part of the action plan.                                   |              |  |  |  |  |  |
| (4) COOPERATIVE ATTITUDE:  Active listener; comments on specific ideas mentioned by others and ties them back to the bigger conversation; shows grace, courtesy and respect to others; shows integrity especially when they do not agree                 |              |  |  |  |  |  |
| (5) <b>DELIVERY:</b> Interesting to listen to; animated; appropriate volume and tone; poised; uses gestures and eye contact; confident and clear   |              |  |  |  |  |  |
| (6) CLOSING STATEMENT:  Shows that they have listened to the conversation; develops relevant and realistic plans; memorable; inspires confidence   |              |  |  |  |  |  |
| Total score for each contestant is to be tabulated by Judge.  Any tie scores are to be broken by Judge. Total of 100 points possible.  |              |  |  |  |  |  |
| Rank contestants: 1 (highest) through (6 lowest).  |              |  |  |  |  |  |

# **Discussion Meet Scoring Rubric**

| (1) OPENING STATEMENT 10 pts.             | <ul> <li>Contestant</li> <li>Does not address the problem – is off topic.</li> <li>Does not address the importance or relevancy of the problem.</li> <li>Makes a "closed" statement that does not allow room for further conversation.</li> <li>Does not seem to have a point of view.</li> <li>Does not finish in the allotted time.</li> </ul> Award 0-3 points  | <ul> <li>Contestant</li> <li>Defines the problem.</li> <li>Sets the problem in context.</li> <li>Makes a statement that leaves some room for further conversation but could be more open.</li> <li>Has a general point of view.</li> <li>Stays in the given time.</li> <li>Award 4-6 points</li> </ul>  | <ul> <li>Contestant</li> <li>Clearly defines the problem.</li> <li>Conveys the importance and relevancy of the problem.</li> <li>Makes an "open" statement that leaves room for further conversation.</li> <li>Sets the stage for an interesting conversation with a very clear point of view.</li> <li>Uses their time very wisely and stays in the given time.</li> <li>Award 7-10 points</li> </ul>  |
|---|--|---|---|
| (2) ANALYSIS OF TOPIC OR PROBLEM: 20 pts. | <ul> <li>Contestant</li> <li>Does not address the problem or does not remain on topic/wanders/distracts.</li> <li>Hasn't done much research or lacks quality facts.</li> <li>Doesn't build on other's ideas, only pushes their own.</li> <li>Doesn't ask questions to clarify other's ideas.</li> <li>Doesn't share relevant personal examples.</li> <li>Misinterprets the issue or does not display competency and therefore does not help with problem solving.</li> <li>Is unaware of FB policy.</li> <li>Award 0-5 points</li> </ul> | <ul> <li>Contestant</li> <li>Identifies the causes of the problem, does not directly address them, but remains on topic.</li> <li>Has done research.</li> <li>Addresses the ideas of others but does not build upon them – or only drops in information they learned without connecting it to previous ideas and moving the conversation forward.</li> <li>Asks some questions to help vet the ideas of others.</li> <li>Shares relevant personal examples – may be slightly off topic.</li> <li>Demonstrates knowledge of this problem but not why it exists.</li> <li>Is aware of current FB policy.</li> </ul> Award 6-12 points | <ul> <li>Contestant</li> <li>Identifies and addresses the causes of the problem and remains on topic.</li> <li>Has thoroughly researched the topic.</li> <li>Confidently builds on the ideas of others to contribute to a coherent analysis</li> <li>Asks relevant questions to vet the ideas of others.</li> <li>Shares relevant personal examples that add to the conversation.</li> <li>Helps ensure thorough analysis before moving to problem solving.</li> <li>Is aware of current and relevant FB policy.</li> <li>Award 13-20 points</li> </ul> |

# **Discussion Meet Scoring Rubric** (continued)

| (3)  | Contestant  | Contestant   | Contestant   |
|--|---|--|--|
| PROBLEM SOLVING AND IMPLEMENTATION 25 pts. | <ul> <li>Instead of helping to guide the conversation to a solution, just data drops.</li> <li>Offers no plan for a solution or a generic plan like "tell our story" or "educate consumers."</li> <li>Does not identify how Farm Bureau is involved.</li> </ul> Award 0-6 points        | <ul> <li>Tries to help lead the conversation to address a solution but misses opportunities to collaborate with the group.</li> <li>Has a plan but is missing specificity.</li> <li>Farm Bureau is mentioned but is not a crucial piece of the solution.</li> <li>Award 7-16 points</li> </ul> | <ul> <li>Is a leader in guiding the group and the conversation to specific and relevant solutions.</li> <li>Generates ideas that contribute to an achievable and specific plan of action to resolve the issue.</li> <li>Clearly defines how Farm Bureau is part of the action plan.</li> <li>Award 17-25 points</li> </ul>                                 |
| (4) COOPERATIVE ATTITUDE: 15 pts.          | <ul> <li>Contestant</li> <li>Does not listen to others – just waits for their turn to talk.</li> <li>Cuts others off or simply repeats what others have already said.</li> <li>Is rude, defensive or combative when they do not agree with others.</li> <li>Award 0-4 points</li> </ul> | Contestant  Contestant listens to others but does not comment specifically on their ideas or tie ideas back to the bigger conversation.  Is respectful of others.  Is not rude or defensive when they disagree with others.  Award 5-9 points  | <ul> <li>Contestant</li> <li>Is an active listener and comments on references or specific ideas mentioned by others tying them back to the bigger conversation.</li> <li>Clearly shows grace, courtesy and respect to other participants.</li> <li>Shows integrity especially when they do not agree with others.</li> <li>Award 10-15 points</li> </ul>   |
| (5) DELIVERY: <b>15 pts.</b>               | Contestant  Is boring/ mumbling/ monotoned.  Slouches, does not use appropriate gestures or have eye contact  Ideas are difficult to understand, or they are not confident in speaking.  Award 0-4 points   | <ul> <li>Contestant</li> <li>Speaks at an appropriate volume and pace with appropriate tone.</li> <li>Uses effective posture, gestures and eye contact.</li> <li>Conveys thoughts and viewpoints but could seem overly rehearsed.</li> <li>Award 5-9 points</li> </ul>                         | <ul> <li>Contestant</li> <li>Is interesting to listen to, animated and lively, speaks at an appropriate volume and with a professional and courteous tone.</li> <li>Is poised and uses gestures and eye contact that emit respect and professionalism.</li> <li>Confidently conveys thoughts and viewpoints clearly</li> <li>Award 10-15 points</li> </ul> |
| (6) CLOSING STATEMENT: 15 pts.             | Contestant  Does not accurately summarize the conversation.  Uses memorized speech that doesn't reflect the content of the conversation.  Closing statement is forgettable.   | <ul> <li>Contestant</li> <li>Summarizes the conversation that happened.</li> <li>Uses take-away points from the discussion to help develop a plan.</li> <li>Closing statement is memorable.</li> </ul>   | <ul> <li>Contestant</li> <li>Shows that they have actively listened to the conversation in their summary.</li> <li>Uses take away points from the discussion to develop relevant, realistic and specific action items and plans for the future.</li> <li>Closing statement is memorable and inspires</li> </ul>  |

## Tie Breaker: Appendix A

### **Discussion Meet: Official Tally Sheet**

Round 1() Round 2()

#### **Competitors: Final Ranking**

| (In Seating Order) | Judge 1 | Judge 2 | Judge 3 | Total | Final Rank |
|--------------------|---------|---------|---------|-------|------------|
| Brutus Buckeye     | 1       | 2       | 1       | 4     | 1          |
| Herbie Husker      | 2       | 3       | 2       | 7     |            |
| Goldy Gopher       | 3       | 1       | 3       | 7     |            |
| Nittany Nellie     | 4       | 4       | 4       | 12    | 4          |

<sup>\*</sup>You have a 1st and 4th place, but a tie for 2nd so move to the first tie breaker

#### **Competitors: Tie Breaker #1 - Problem Solving and Implementation**

| (In Seating Order) | Judge 1 | Judge 2 | Judge 3 | Total | Final Rank |
|--------------------|---------|---------|---------|-------|------------|
| Brutus Buckeye     | 1       | 2       | 1       | 4     | 1          |
| Herbie Husker      | 2       | 3       | 2       | 7     |            |
| Goldy Gopher       | 3       | 1       | 3       | 7     |            |
| Nittany Nellie     | 4       | 4       | 4       | 12    | 4          |

<sup>\*</sup>You still have a tie. Move to 2nd tie breaker

#### **Competitors: Tie Breaker #2 – Analysis of Topic**

| (In Seating Order) Judge 1 | Judge 2 | Judge 3 | Total Fin | al Rank |   |
|----------------------------|---------|---------|-----------|---------|---|
| Brutus Buckeye             | 1       | 2       | 1         | 4       | 1 |
| Herbie Husker              | 3       | 1       | 3         | 7       |   |
| Goldy Gopher               | 2       | 3       | 2         | 7       |   |
| Nittany Nellie             | 4       | 4       | 4         | 12      | 4 |

<sup>\*</sup>You still have a tie. Move to 3rd tie breaker

#### **Competitors: Tie Breaker #3 – Cooperative Attitude**

| (In Seating Order) | Judge 1 | Judge 2 | Judge 3 | Total | Final Rank |
|--------------------|---------|---------|---------|-------|------------|
| Brutus Buckeye     | 2       | 1       | 1       | 4     | 1          |
| Herbie Husker      | 1       | 2       | 3       | 6     | 2          |
| Goldy Gopher       | 3       | 3       | 2       | 8     | 3          |
| Nittany Nellie     | 4       | 4       | 4       | 12    | 4          |

<sup>\*</sup>With no ties, there is a final rank. You now have a 2nd and 3rd place. Remember the rankings that are clear in the first box do not ever change, even if they were to fall from that rank in one of the tie breaker boxes.

## Tie Breaker: Appendix B

### **Discussion Meet: Official Tally Sheet**

Round 1() Round 2()

#### **Competitors: Final Ranking**

| (In Seating Order) | Judge 1 | Judge 2 | Judge 3 | Total | <b>Final Rank</b> |
|--------------------|---------|---------|---------|-------|-------------------|
| Clark Kent         | 2       | 3       | 2       | 7     | 2                 |
| Peter Parker       | 3       | 2       | 4       | 9     | 3                 |
| Bruce Wayne        | 1       | 1       | 1       | 3     | 1                 |
| Tony Stark         | 4       | 4       | 3       | 11    | 4                 |

<sup>\*</sup>Technically, you do not need to go any further since you have a rank, but please fill out the entire form.

#### **Competitors: Tie Breaker #1 - Problem Solving and Implementation**

| (In Seating Order) J | udge 1 Judge | 2 Judge | 3 Total | Final Rank |   |
|----------------------|--------------|---------|---------|------------|---|
| Clark Kent           | 2            | 1       | 2       | 5          | 2 |
| Peter Parker         | 4            | 3       | 3       | 10         | 3 |
| Bruce Wayne          | 1            | 2       | 1       | 4          | 1 |
| Tony Stark           | 3            | 4       | 4       | 11         | 4 |

#### **Competitors: Tie Breaker #2 – Analysis of Topic**

| (In Seating Order) | Judge 1 | Judge 2 | Judge 3 | Total | Final Rank |
|--------------------|---------|---------|---------|-------|------------|
| Clark Kent         | 1       | 4       | 3       | 8     | 3          |
| Peter Parker       | 4       | 3       | 4       | 11    | 4          |
| Bruce Wayne        | 3       | 1       | 1       | 5     | 1          |
| Tony Stark         | 2       | 2       | 2       | 6     | 2          |

<sup>\*</sup>Even though the rank is different from the official rank, it does not change the official rank.

#### **Competitors: Tie Breaker #3 - Cooperative Attitude**

| (In Seating Order) | Judge 1 | Judge 2 | Judge 3 | Total | Final Rank |
|--------------------|---------|---------|---------|-------|------------|
| Clark Kent         | 1       | 2       | 2       | 5     | 2          |
| Peter Parker       | 3       | 4       | 3       | 10    | 3          |
| Bruce Wayne        | 2       | 1       | 1       | 4     | 1          |
| Tony Stark         | 4       | 3       | 4       | 11    | 4          |